

第 B-4 場：全球地方議員論壇籌備大會
Session B-4: Preparatory Meeting for Global Councils Forum

主持人：

林晉章 榮譽理事長
台灣地方議員聯盟 創辦人

討論內容：

1. 檢討第 4 屆 ACF、討論第 5 屆 ACF 的主辦國暨簽署本屆 ACF 聯合宣言。
2. 召開「全球地方議員論壇」(Global Councils Forum, GCF) 的籌備會。

各國代表：

- 日本會議地方議員聯合會 (JLCA) 松田良昭 Yoshiaki Matsuda 會長
- 菲律賓議員聯盟 (PCL) Danilo Dayanghirang 全國主席
- 泰國曼谷首都議會 (BMC) Nirunde Praditkul 第二副議長
- 巴基斯坦旁遮普省地方議會協會 (LCAP) Fozia Khalid Waraich 會長
- 吐瓦魯富納富提市宗族代表議會 Siliga Atiake Kofe 酋長
- 帛琉柯羅州議會 (Koror State Legislature) Alan T. Marbou 議長
- 巴西全國州議會及議員聯盟 (UNALE) Kennedy Nunes 會長
- 香港社區管治匯林 甘文鋒 ((Kam Man-fung)) 首席代表

林晉章：



我們現在來進行第四場次的座談，我們分兩個階段。

上半場是要談第四屆亞洲地方議員論壇的一個題目，第一個就是亞洲地方議員聯盟聯合宣言；第二個，是下一個年度亞洲地方議員論壇舉辦的國家；第三個是檢討這次的活動。

下半場，我們要討論 GCF 全球地方議員論壇籌備成立的事宜，所以我們的議程，請各位翻開第 200 頁，我們先來看今天的議程：第一個就是探討我們的聯合宣言，第二個就是下一次的主辦國，第三個就是這次活動的檢討，以及其他事項。各位對我們的議程，有沒有甚麼意見？



Danilo Dayanghirang (菲律賓議員聯盟, PCL):

依據菲律賓議員聯盟憲章，如果要這樣的話，必須要回到我們的董事會來討論，所以我們可能要回到馬尼拉在全國委員會中來討論。一般來講，如果有更新事項，我們跟大家再來更新，我們要徵詢一下我們的全國委員會。

林晉章：

現在只是先針對今天的議程的確認，議程有沒有其他的意見？如果沒有的話，我們就確定今天的議程。

我們今天有三個議程。第一個，是確認我們的地方議員聯盟的一個聯合宣言。有關這個聯合宣言，我們會前有送到各個首席代表團的國家，各位可以先看這份文件，在各個首席代表的桌上放了兩份的文件草案，這兩份草案有個差別，其中一個是有寫「目的」的，就是在第二頁有增加了一段「目的」，「目的」內容是日本方面提出來的建議，這個建議不一定要放在宣言上，但是要先確認大家同意這個目的內容。我們看過以後，覺得應該是符合我們的宗旨，我想是不是請工作人員將這個目的的內容給它唸一下。

司儀：(宣讀成立目的內容)

在這個全球化時代，世界地方議員需要一起合作來創造經濟的活絡，同時我們也要促進跨國的一些溝通，尊重自由平等多元的亞洲的價值觀，還有跨域的共榮。我們要確保所有區域性的穩定，並且來支持未來人才的培育，最終可以為世界和平跟繁榮帶來貢獻。

林晉章：

這個是由日本來提出的，我想是不是請日本松田會長，也來跟我們做一個補充說明。

松田良昭 (日本會議地方議員聯合會):

這個是我們日本這邊的提案，希望各個其他代表的國家都能夠認同。

林晉章：

松田會長他們是說，我們是不是可以通過這個目的的內容，但是不一定要放在這個共同宣言裡面，我不知道會長你的意思是不是這樣子？通過這個目的，但是不一定要放在我們的宣言裡頭。

松田良昭 (日本會議地方議員聯合會):



是。

林晉章：

好的。誠如剛剛菲律賓會長所講的，依照他們的章程規定，他們要到外面簽署任何東西，都要提到他們的理事會來討論確認，就像 2015 年菲律賓的會長 Maybelyn Fernandez 來到台灣，我們共同希望菲律賓能夠舉辦第一屆的 ACF。當時 Maybelyn 也提出同樣的想法，很清楚地告訴我們必須要回去得到他們全國理事會的通過以後，才能夠確認。所以他們後來通過以後，還要我去菲律賓，特別給我一個他們理事會通過的決議文，由他們來主辦，所以我想剛剛菲律賓會長所講的這一段話，應該是對的。

也就是說，我們今天討論完是否生效還是要各位帶回去，經過理事會的討論確認以後，才能夠正式生效。我們 2014 年也通過一個宣言，當年美國日本代表也都有前來參與，雖然當場大家沒有甚麼意見，可是歐盟代表還表示要帶回去，經過他們理事會確認結果，一樣也是給我們一份通過的確認文件，這個等一下我會再跟各位解釋。

所以針對剛剛菲律賓的會長所做的表示，我們應該同意你的看法——我們今天先行討論確認，也許等一下會有一個簽署的儀式，但是我們可能要做成一個附帶決議：這個宣言還要等送回各個國家的理事會通過以後，才能夠正式生效。好，香港代表要發言。

甘文鋒（香港社區管治匯林）：

謝謝主席，我是關注第四跟第五項，因為我們香港本來就不是國家。我看後面這個「Nation」改成「Region」可不可以？

林晉章：

好，第四跟第五項的地方，我們工作同仁也有注意到。我想先處理宣言草案本來是沒有放目的的部分。日本方面認為我們是不是先通過一個目的，不必一定要放在宣言當中，剛剛松田也是表達這個態度，所以我想我們是不是對日本提出的意見，今天做出一個決議，然後這個當然還是要各位帶回去各個理事會通過以後，再給我們一個確認文件才算真正生效。有關這個目的的內容剛剛已經宣讀過了，不知道各位有沒有甚麼意見？有沒有甚麼修改？有沒有反對？

Danilo Dayanghirang（菲律賓議員聯盟, PCL）：

我前面說的，我們只能保留權利，必須要帶回去經過理事會正式同意。這是

我們菲律賓的部分，因為我們章程禁止我們在沒有得到允許之前簽署這樣子的聲明，但是我們是支持這樣的聲明的。

林晉章：

我想這個立場，我們應該給予尊重跟支持，確實國際上的慣例也應該如此，因為我們這次準備宣言的時間也蠻匆促，也就是沒有很足夠的時間讓各位提到理事會去做討論。我想這一點我是支持的，所以我想我們今天就做先行的討論，如果大家達成共識，就做成決議內容，送回各個理事會去討論，但是菲律賓的理事長是不是認為，我們今天就做成決議文，但不要簽署？

Danilo Dayanghirang (菲律賓議員聯盟, PCL)：

就菲律賓來說，我們保留簽署的權力。時機對了，我們就會來簽署，像我前面說的，我必須經過理事會的同意。

林晉章：

今天我們是有準備一個儀式讓大家簽署，但是同時做成一個附帶決議，就是這個宣言必須得到各個國家的理事會通過，正式回覆它才算生效。要這樣子做，還是我們明年再來簽？

Danilo Dayanghirang (菲律賓議員聯盟, PCL)：

另外一個選項，就是我們跟理事會討論，再來跟這裡回覆。

林晉章：

假設今天我們通過先簽，保留一個條件，就是要理事會通過才正式生效，可不可以這樣子？

Danilo Dayanghirang (菲律賓議員聯盟, PCL)：

這個我沒有辦法執行。

林晉章：

這個應該要尊重，所以我們今天只是討論，大家沒有意見，大家各自帶回去。今天就不要簽署，好不好？不然會給大家為難。對於菲律賓的建議，我們可以討論，大家得到共識，帶回各會去討論，但是今天不簽署，各位有沒有意見？有沒有反對？有沒有異議？

沒有的話，我們決議程序上就是說，我們今天討論過取得共識，但是今天不



簽，各位帶回去之後通過這個文，但是簽署的動作今天沒有做，簽署的事未來可以補做，各位有沒有反對？好，沒有反對，我們就通過菲律賓所提的這個案子。

Danilo Dayanghirang (菲律賓議員聯盟, PCL):

關於這個共識的形成過程，我們認為這個時機是很不錯的，至於簽署，我們菲律賓沒有辦法現在簽署。

林晉章:

謝謝菲律賓的提示，我們剛剛也通過這個宣言了，因為這個資料已經都發給大家，是不是請工作人員先唸一下。

司儀:(宣讀宣言)

我們從亞洲各國來，齊聚台北，我們希望能夠在亞洲促進合作，來達成在 2018 年 8 月 21 日亞洲地方議員議會所達成的共識。

我們也注意到亞洲地方議員聯盟，旨在聚集亞洲各國的地方議員及政府官員，並從中蒐集地方治理和監督的見解及經驗，以助於有效的跨國交流。亞洲各國的地方立法會之間的合作可以帶來區域連結、區域和平穩定、議會民主、經濟繁榮，以及永續發展。

我們體認到亞洲地方議員聯盟促進雙方互動合作，有助於亞洲文化各異的地區及國家增進彼此了解及建立信任關係。

我們再次肯定 2018 年 8 月 21 日在日本舉辦的亞洲地方議員論壇大會上，所簽署的聯合聲明，在開放透明及包容的原則下強化地方的連結。亞洲地方議員聯盟從 2016 年承辦以來，各亞洲國家的參與者都貢獻心力，共同推動合作、跨國經驗分享，以及最重要的民主價值。

我們在這邊同意並簽署以下宣言，第四屆亞洲地方議員聯盟聯合宣言強調亞洲各民主國家地方立法會的核心價值，並肯定其在參與式民主當中不可或缺的貢獻。我們主張：

一、任何認同亞洲地方議員聯盟的價值與願景的地方立法聯盟，或地方議會，皆有權參與。

二、亞洲地方議員聯盟的與會者都應該要有共同的權益，不論種族、膚色、語言、性別和宗教的差異。

三、亞洲地方議員聯盟之與會者都應該秉持著非政府及非營利組織的精神，宣揚世界和平以及全人類的福祉的理念。



- 四、亞洲地方議員聯盟的與會者應限於民主國家。
- 五、亞洲地方議員聯盟的與會者應該遵守該國的法律。
- 六、亞洲地方議員聯盟的與會者皆同意並支持全球地方議員聯盟的成立。

林晉章：

謝謝我們工作人員的宣讀，我想各位都讀過了。除了剛剛香港已經有提出針對第四和第五點有修正的意見，這個等一下我來處理，在第二頁的第四和第五點香港有提出修正的建議。我們很快的一段一段處理。

第一段 Recalling 各位有沒有意見？如果沒有意見，大家就有共識。

第二段 Noting 有沒有意見？好，共識。

第三段 Recognizing 這一段各位有沒有意見？如果沒有，取得共識。

第四段 Acknowledging 這一段有沒有意見？沒有，取得共識。

第五段 Reaffirming 這一段有沒有意見？

第六段 Appreciating 這一段有沒有意見？沒有，取得共識。

好，菲律賓請發言。

PCL（菲律賓議員聯盟）：

不好意思，林先生，我們想要回到 Recognizing 第三條這邊：「亞洲各國的地方立法會之間的合作可帶來區域連結、區域和平穩定、議會民主、經濟繁榮，以及永續發展。」

我們建議，不見得要講「區域」(Region)，我們可以講「地方」(Local)。亞洲的「地方」和平穩定，把「國家」(Nation) 這個字拿掉，就像前面甘文鋒代表所講到的問題，這樣子就可以避免。也許我們不要講到各國、講到「國家」，我們就講亞洲的「地方」立法會。

林晉章：

我們非常謝謝提出這個建議，這個也是我們一直在考慮。我們當時在處理的時候，就在想說，像今天早上我們柯文哲市長提到，世界上有聯合國 (UN)、國會議員聯盟 (IPU)、城市與地方政府聯盟 (United Cities and Local Governments, UCLG)，就缺這一塊全球地方議員聯盟。要加入 UCLG 地方政府聯盟，有兩個模式可以參加：一個就是全國性的地方政府協會去參加，另一個則是每一個地方政府「單獨」去參加，他們有兩種模式。事實上來講，我們的 GCF 等一下就可以準備成立一個憲章的討論小組。我們在 ACF 都沒有做過這個討論，我覺得剛剛菲律賓的這個建議，其實就是我們一直未來想引導大家去討論的事。



我們將來 GCF 和 ACF 到底要不要像 UCLG 一樣，全國總會像 PCL，像台灣也已經是一個全國協會，日本、巴基斯坦也是協會，但看起來泰國好像還沒有成立。很多的國家還沒有成立，如果還沒有成立的時候，是不是可以以「單獨」的地方議會去參加？這個就是要經過討論的。所以等一下我們都把它先讀一下。這個意見我們會紀錄下來。我覺得剛剛菲律賓代表所提出來的意見應該深入，等一下我會做處理。

今天也許我們先讀過以後，把問題留下來，然後是不是成立一個討論的小組？把這時候我們發起創立的日本、菲律賓、台灣先組織起來，大家先成立一個小組來討論 ACF 的憲章。這樣下來，可能就可以把這個問題釐清，是不是我提這個建議？也就是我們接受關於菲律賓剛剛所提的提議，不知道各位是否同意我們這樣處理？我再講一次，我這個程序上的處理，這樣子可以嗎？就是剛剛菲律賓提的確實是問題，像泰國它還沒有成立全國性的組織，將來就可以以「曼谷市議會」的名義來申請入會，像帛琉他們好像也只有十六個「州議會」，今天來的就是其中一個州議會議長，它們沒有組成十六個州議會的全國議會組織。如果以「單獨」的一個議會名義，依照 UCLG 的規定是可以的參加的，全國地方政府協會他們是可以的。

所以我的意思是，我們是不是也成立一個小組來討論這個事情？不要在今天做成決定，這樣子是不是也符合香港剛剛所說的提議。對這個方面的問題正式成立一個小組來討論，這個問題是屬於永續的問題，應該不急著今天做成決定。各位還有沒有其他的意見？有沒有反對？沒有的話，就支持這個案子了。

也就是說，關於甚麼資格可以入會，像香港和泰國他們目前都沒有組成聯合協會，但將來它們都可能去籌組，所以我們是不是像 UCLG 一樣讓它雙軌都可以加入？有關這些問題都交由這個小組來討論，剛剛大家好像都支持相關的問題，就是讓這個小組來討論決定。

第一頁我們就這樣取得共識，我們現在再來看第二頁。第二頁的主文各位有沒有意見？

BMC (泰國曼谷首都議會, BMC):

下午好！我想稍微解釋一下泰國這邊，我們其實是有了一個全國性的地方政府聯盟，也包括了議會，所以我在這裡想跟你分享一下，泰國是有這樣子的組織，它其實就是一個全國層級的聯盟。就曼谷首都議會的立場來說，如果你願意接受我們的組織成為 GCF 的會員的話，我覺得我們是可以獨立出來做聲請的，因為我們只是曼谷的地方議會而已。我並不是反對菲律賓的提案，我只是跟你釐清一

下。

林晉章：

我想將來如果成立這個小組，我希望泰國你們也不要推辭，希望能派代表來加入我們憲章的討論。剛剛泰國講到地方政府協會，包括市長、政府、議員，事實上，在世界上有很多的國家都是跟泰國一樣。

像這次本來有報名要來的斯里蘭卡，他們也是叫做地方政府協會，跟泰國一樣，他們這個地方政府協會就包括政府官員市長和議員。UCLG 它全球的總會長，全世界地方政府協會的會長，就是南非籍的議員。



為什麼這個議員可以作為地方政府協會的會長？因為雖然它是議員，但是根據南非的制度，他們的市長就必須由議員來擔任，所以它就變成市長的身分，然後他們就組成南非的地方政府協會，由這個地方政府協會去參加這個 UCLG 全球地方政府協會。結果，他被選為全

球地方政府協會的會長，但是他本身原始就是議員，因為當選議員才可以去當市長。

所以世界上有兩套制度，今天早上我們的柯文哲市長說，他也去參加過 UCLG，我們台北市政府也是會員，但是他也樂觀其成，希望我們亞洲地方議員聯盟能夠由「純」議員組成一個協會，然後全球也是純議員組成一個協會，因為議員就是在監督政府機關。所以我在此回覆泰國這個建議，順便把我們當初的原意跟各位做以上的說明，謝謝泰國。

接下來第二頁第一段主文，各位如果沒有意見，我們就取得共識，但是全案我們還是保留。

Kennedy Nunes (巴西全國州議會及議員聯盟 UNALE)：

不好意思，林會長，巴西代表想在此做一個建議。在巴西全國州議會及議員聯盟和全美洲議會聯盟，我們推廣的是「類外交」(para-diplomacy)，就是由地方議會所推行的外交活動。傳統的外交，處理的是國防、國界、邊界這方面的問

題，而今天我們地方議會所推動的，就是「類外交」，就是經驗交流。

因為我們的角色，並不是中央政府或者是國會，也並沒有要取代它的意思，我們知道他們的角色是甚麼，我們也知道我們的角色是甚麼，尤其是我們地方議會更接近市民，比他們這些中央的單位還要接近市民。



因此我想要建議，就像我們在全美洲議員聯盟和巴西全國州議會及議員聯盟決議文裡，我們用的就是「類外交」，不管是全美洲、南美洲，還是巴西，我們都採用「類外交」的字眼，之後就不會再發生使用字眼的問題，以上代表我個人的建議。

林晉章：

非常謝謝來自巴西 UNALE 的會長，他也是未來「全美洲議會聯盟」(COPA) 會長。UNALE 就是巴西二十七個州議會及議員的聯合會，現在的會長就是剛發言的這位會長，然後他明年二月就要接任全美洲議會聯盟的會長，它的簡稱叫 COPA，所以他們已經運作多年，很有經驗了。他們的經驗可以提供給我們 ACF 在執行上的一個參考，非常謝謝會長。

我們逐一就一、二、三、四、五、六條文了解大家的意見，這裡面只要牽涉到「國家」(Nation)，或許我們將來用「類外交」等的字眼，就可以解決掉這些問題，都是更貼近我們人民的議會。我們要結合起來，互相交流經驗，但並不是在幫中央政府做外交的工作。

我們請看第一段，各位有沒有甚麼意見？沒有的話，基本上我們就取得共識，第二段有沒有意見？

PCL：

第一段這邊，對不起回到剛剛這個 Recalling 這邊。「Recalling」其實是有別的意思，好像就是有「移除」(Remove) 的意思，所以我們可以把它改成「建基於」、「立基於.....之上」(Building on)，這會聽起來比較正面的。第一頁這邊有一個「Recalling」，因為「Recalling」法律上也可以有「移除」或「收回」(Take back) 的意思，所以我這邊認為將它改成「立基於」，或者是「建構於.....之上」，我會



用「Building on」這樣的字眼，我們之前已經做過一些承諾，然後我要「建基於」我的承諾之上。

林晉章：

非常謝謝來自菲律賓的代表，她也是律師，所以對文字是這麼重視，我想我們也接受他的建議，將來再處理的時候再將它放進去，謝謝你的提醒。

現在我們在進行第一個條文，有沒有甚麼意見？像剛剛這樣子提出來都很好，作為我們小組的參考。如果沒有的話，我們取得共識。

第二？好，取得共識。

第三就是我們必須是一個 NGO 或是一個 NPO。好，取得共識，這很重要。

第四第五，除了剛剛香港所提的意見外，各位還有沒有甚麼問題？第四第五，就是將來我們要納入小組來討論的。好，如果沒有其他意見，我們就加以保留。

第六，我覺得第六這一點，是不是今天大家就取得共識？我們在 2014 年就有這個構想。菲律賓和日本很早就成立自己全國的協會了，很多國家都很早就成立這個議員聯盟組織，但是都沒有互相的往返。

我們在 2014 年邀請 NCSL 美國州議員聯合會，其實我們很早就邀請過巴西，他們也邀請過我們，但是大家都沒有正式的往來。2014 年我們也邀請歐盟的地方區域議會聯合會（CALRE）會長過來，那一次日本也參加，結果我們就邀請大家在 2015 年，就是第二年，討論成立全球的這個聯盟。

結果在 2015 年討論的時候，歐盟的義大利籍的會長就告訴我們說，透過 2014 年我們的引薦，歐盟跟 NCSL 他們就做了一個很密切的結盟，然後在 2015 年的十月，歐盟的會議就邀請日本、台灣還有菲律賓到米蘭去開會，在那裏才碰到了巴西 UNALE 的代表，還有來自加拿大的 FCM，我們這幾個在米蘭相遇甚歡。後來來自歐盟的會長建議亞洲應該建立 ACF，所以才有菲律賓所舉辦的第一屆會議，2017 台灣辦第二屆，日本辦第三屆，今天辦第四屆回到台灣來。

也就是說，我們已經連續辦了四屆，而且有越來越多的國家加入，所以我們現在要來開始討論章程，把 ACF 辦起來。我們將來也要和歐盟 CALRE，美國的 NCSL 以及南美洲的 UNALE 跟 COPA，還有澳洲 ALGA 做一個密切的結合，將這些組織結合起來，變成一個 GCF。

巴西在明年的十一月份舉辦年會，雖然很遠，但是他們今天在致詞中公開的邀請我們亞洲的國家明年十一月到巴西去。如果我們去就可以見到那個盛況，那

麼成立全球的 GCF 就指日可待了，是有可能成功的。

我將這個過去的歷程，跟各位報告，是否大家就同意接受巴西的邀請，明年十一月到巴西去參加他們的會議？昨天我試探了一下，很多的亞洲國家都想要去，現場是不是有國家要表達支持這個建議？請菲律賓代表發言。

Danilo Dayanghirang (菲律賓議員聯盟 PCL)：

我們支持成立全球地方議員論壇，這是一個對國際關係很有幫助的做法，但在這之前，我想要再退回去來表達菲律賓的建議，那就是不要講「Recalling」，我覺得這可以直接解決。雖然你說之後會來討論研究，但我覺得我們現在就可以做出決定。我們可以說「立基於.....之上」(Building on)，不要說「Recalling」。這個是不是現在就做出決定，是否大家都同意呢？

林晉章：

好，「Recalling」那個字就照這個建議來修改。針對這個第六項，我想我們就取得一個強烈共識。這個對於我們在全球跟他們發生的時候會有很大的幫忙。這一點我們今天就做成很強烈的共識，對這句我們就做成正式的決議，大家有沒有意見？

BMC (泰國曼谷首都議會, BMC)：

主席先生，請容我做個建議，第四點把「國家」(Nation)改成「區域」(Region)，這個是因為香港代表的建議。但如果把「國家」改成「區域」，那其實是不合理的。這其實沒有指稱到任何東西，沒有甚麼「區域」叫做「民主區域」，你可不可以再釐清一下？

林晉章：

謝謝泰國的發言，提出這樣的疑問。這個部分，我剛剛已經講過了，全球的地方政府聯盟，它們除了有全國性的組織之外，每一個地方政府如果沒有組成全國性的組織，這個地方政府是可以單獨加入的，這是可以被接受的。

在 UCLG 就是這種態度，所以將來我們的 ACF 或是 GCF，是不是也要比照 UCLG，有國家就用全國組織，沒有全國組織就單獨用地方政府或者是地方議會的名義加入。因為我們是議員的組織，所以只有議會可以申請，這個也是因為關係到我們未來長久的發展，所以非常的重要，也因此我們才希望成立一個特別小組，在場的國家如果有興趣都可以派代表參加，大家可以來共同的討論。這樣是不是有回答泰國的發問？好，請香港代表發言。

甘文鋒（香港社區管治匯林）：



不好意思，我來解釋一下，其實我們香港只是一個「Region」，是一個特別行政區（Special Administrative Region），所以我們只能代表我們的「區域」，無法代表我們的「國家」，我們的政治現實就是這樣。

林晉章：

好，謝謝！我也了解這個狀況，所以這個部分，我們今天就不做成決議，另外成立一個小組去討論 ACF 和 GCF 的章程。

剛剛第六點支持 GCF 的成立是一個表態，將來給歐盟的 CALRE 或是美國的 NCSL 看到我們的決心，這樣子對 GCF 的成立更有幫助。第六點應該各位沒有意見吧？沒有的話，是不是我們就用掌聲通過這一條？（掌聲）OK，謝謝！

我想請教菲律賓的會長，我們今天如果其他的都沒有通過，就只通過第六點，你可不可以簽署？

Danilo Dayanghirang（菲律賓議員聯盟 PCL）：

可以。

林晉章：

等一下我們在上面簽署的時候，我們就只簽署這句話，所有參加者都支持要全球地方議員聯盟(Global Councils Forum)的成立，等一下就做這個簽署的儀式，沒有其他意見的話，這個案子就討論到這裡。

所以我們今天就通過日本提議的 Purpose，就是只有目的部分，然後我們的整個宣言並沒有通過，而是成立一個小組。我希望這個小組，以日本、台灣、菲律賓為主，其他的國家包括泰國，所有的亞洲國家都希望你們報名參加。你們可以推派，然後我們就成立一個小組去討論這個章程內容。我們不急，亞洲的章程就請 UNALE 當指導給我們意見，那這個部分就處理到這裡。



接下來，我們繼續進行下一個題目，就是明年的第五屆亞洲地方議員聯盟大會，我剛剛已經講過第一屆台灣，第二屆是菲律賓，三屆是日本，四屆回到台灣，為什麼台灣在第二屆跟第四屆都辦理？因為剛開始的時候，參與的國家很少，所以台灣就自告奮勇說，如果在還沒有很多國家參與的時候，台灣因為是發起人，我們願意兩年辦一次，但是如果參與的國家多的時候，我們可以承諾四年辦一次。

今年我們剛辦了，明年原先有討論香港他們想辦，但是因為他們最近的情況比較特殊，裡面總是在做一些調整，所以基本上我曾經徵詢過他們，明年舉辦可能還有一些困難，等未來還有機會，他們很願意來主辦。我也請教過菲律賓的會長，但他給我的回答是他們的議員也希望利用這個機會到亞洲的其他國家去走一走，是不是不要那麼快又回到菲律賓？

如果找不到國家來主辦，那我們第五屆可能就要停止了，所以我們在想說，是不是菲律賓，還是這次組了很龐大團體來參加的泰國來辦？但是泰國去年才主辦過東協的議員會議。請菲律賓會長發言。

Danilo Dayanghirang (菲律賓議員聯盟 PCL):

我們菲律賓覺得大家的機會要同等，我們已經在馬尼拉辦過一次了，如果我們從泰國來的朋友下一次想要主辦的話，我們絕對支持，大家的機會要同等。如果泰國不想要主辦的話，菲律賓就非常願意接受，但是我還是覺得大家的機會都一樣，大家輪流來主辦。

林晉章：

我們泰國現在要發言。

Nirunde Praditkul：

這件事要先在曼谷市的市議會討論一下，如果我們全部都同意的話，就會把這個意見呈報內政部，然後內政部就會進行第二次的討論，如果內政部也同意的話，我們就可以主辦。這次出席會議的泰國團只是曼谷市議會的三分之一而已。

林晉章：

謝謝來自泰國的第二副議長做了剛剛的說明。我們一直非常的尊重體制，所以在 2015 年，當我們決定要成立 ACF，第一屆要由菲律賓舉辦的時候，菲律賓的首席代表 Maybelyn 會長，跟剛剛泰國講的一樣，她說回去要經過他們的理事會同意，再經過內政部的同意，兩個完全一樣，最後得到正式的同意通過。



我們請 belyn 站起來給大家看一下好不好！

當時就是她跟我，還有我們的松田會長一起創會的，當時謝謝菲律賓舉辦了第一屆，才有後來的發展。我們也非常謝謝菲律賓的會長講得很清楚，他說讓大家有機會，泰國的代表團看起來很龐大，如果他們有意願辦，就讓他們先回去討論以後再作決定，如果可以，明年就讓泰國接辦，如果泰國不行，剛剛菲律賓講得很清楚，他們願意接手主辦。

這個就好像去年第三屆在日本開的時候，日本的會長就一直在問第四屆誰要辦？我當時表示因為本人的任期要結束了，我的新會長還沒有產生，我一定要尊重新會長的看法，然後才能決定日期，基本上由台灣辦我們都樂意，但是日期的決定要尊重新的會長。

結果大家也同意保留到今年七月，我們的新會長產生之後才決定在十二月辦，所以很多情形都要回到國內才能處理。我們是不是把今天的情況列入紀錄：泰國願意把這個情形帶回去討論，然後很快地告訴我們明年是否要主辦第五屆的會議，如果不行，那我們就請菲律賓考量來主辦。我們還是希望這個會議不要中斷，因為好不容易辦了四年，參加的國家也越來越多，如果中斷未免太可惜，我們先做成這樣的紀錄，也謝謝泰國跟菲律賓。

甘文鋒（香港社區管治匯林）：

非常的謝謝，我有一個提議，就是菲律賓他們好像也有意思辦，不如我們現在先把它定下來：2020 年是泰國，2021 年是菲律賓。菲律賓也要兩年的時間去準備，萬一泰國不能辦的話，菲律賓接手也會比較容易一點。先定兩年以後要主辦的國家，讓未來要主辦的國家有比較充分的時間去準備。

林晉章：

他的建議，就是希望兩年以前定下主辦單位，但是我們能把下一年的主辦國家找出來就不錯了，所以我們希望香港可以嘗試接辦 2021 年的大會。香港雖然他不是發起國，當初發起是我們台灣、日本和菲律賓三國，但是第一屆大會舉辦的時候，香港就有參加了。

所以香港是從第一屆、第二屆、第三屆、第四屆都曾經參與的，照講他們是可以辦的，但是各位都知道香港最近的情況，我們要諒解他們，是不是我們先把明年的主辦國家確定就好了？因此我還是先決定下一年的主辦國好不好？這個議題我們就這樣子決定。

我們接著討論下一個，就是對這一次的大會活動的意見檢討，我們因為人力



有限，所以有部分恐怕招呼不周，我們感到非常的抱歉，還請各位多多包涵。如果各位有甚麼建議，我們可以開放幾個人講話，因為我們下面還有一個程序。如果沒有機會發言的人，可以用書面給我們建議，大家不必客氣，因為這個書面的資料，可以給下一個主辦的單位作參考。巴西請發言。

Kennedy Nunes (巴西全國州議會及議員聯盟, UNALE):

不要忘記明年的十一月，我們邀請大家去巴西。

林晉章：

所以明年的大會，我們要辦理的時間要避開明年的十一月，因為巴西要邀請我們去巴西參加他們大會。

謝謝各位，對這次的大會還有甚麼意見？是不是請各國的代表蒐集一下大家的意見？辦理這樣的一個大活動確實很不容易，有招呼不周還請各位包涵，今天晚上等一下這邊結束以後，我們有準備車輛載各位到餐廳，我們希望大家能夠比昨天晚上更嗨一點，讓大家友誼更常存。

明天早上，因為包括日本、香港、泰國他們都要回國去，日本是中午的飛機，泰國是晚上，所以我們還在研究，是不是讓泰國中途從新北市活動中先回飯店，可以趕晚上的飛機，明天下午的活動他們就不參加了。

明天的行程，因為要到新北市比較遠，所以我們八點鐘就要出發，大概七點五十就要開始集合了，麻煩各位注意早一點起床。如果沒有人發言，對本次大會如果有任何意見，請用書面提供給我們好不好？我們 ACF 的部分就討論到這，而且要記住巴西一再地提明年十一月歡迎各位到巴西去參加他們的大會。

各位請再看下面一個程序，請各位看 203 頁資料，這個是去年在日本簽署的聯合聲明，這個資料就留給大家參考。203 頁 204 頁都是去年的內容，我們現在看 205 頁，對於今天的討論也許沒那麼重要，但是我們還是瀏覽一下。

接下來請大家看 207 頁，目前可能也無法做太多的討論，我們就交換一下意見，探討一下大家的看法，我們就照這個程序來走，各位有沒有意見？如果沒有意見，我們就照個程序走一下。第三個就是有關我們把 2014 跟 2015 兩次做的會議紀錄給大家宣讀一下，因為有些國家現在才加入，我讓大家回想一下，我們把它紀錄下來，我們是不是請工作人員，把會議紀錄給宣讀一下？

司儀：

2014 年會議紀錄如下：



台灣地方議員聯盟

Taiwan Councilors Forum

A. 全球地方議員論壇得與舉辦國單位年會合辦，該會主席即為當年全球地方議員論壇的會長。

B. 論壇主題：主辦國應指定該年度全球地方議員論壇的主題。

C. 註冊費：每位與會者，需繳交美金\$500 給該年大會籌辦單位。此註冊費用用途為協助會議的籌備，但並不包含機票和住宿。(註：2016 年亞洲地方議員論壇經同意僅收取美金\$200 作為註冊費)

D. 同步口譯：主辦國單位應提供該國官方語言與英文之同步口譯，與會單位若有其他語言翻譯服務之需求，應承擔相應之口譯服務費用。

2015 年會議紀錄如下：

A. 正式論壇名稱：與會者皆同意並承認以「全球地方議員聯盟」作為本組織正式名稱。

B. 成立初擬宣言：與會者都同意並承認初擬宣言。

C. 亞洲地方議員論壇：台灣、日本、菲律賓應首先成立亞洲地方議員聯盟，歐洲區域聯合會 CALRE，美國全美洲議會聯合會 NCSL，及巴西全國州議會及議員聯盟 UNALE 將隨後加入，並協助擴展全球地方議員聯盟版圖。(註：亞洲地方議員聯盟即在相應後三年分別在菲律賓 2016，台灣 2017，日本 2018 舉辦)

林晉章：

這是給大家一個參考，讓大家了解過去的資料。請各位看 210 頁附件，當時參加的組織有 NCSL、CALRE、日本跟台灣，這個文件當時經過日本和美國表示沒有意見，CALRE 也跟剛剛講的一樣，要帶回他們的理事會去討論。各位看 211 頁，211 頁就是 CALRE 歐盟的會長他們帶回去，經過他們的理事會討論以後就正式行文，因為美國當時在會場是表達沒有意見，歐盟則是表達他們要帶回去理事會討論，這個就是他們討論後的正式行文給我們的內容。

對於我們發表宣言及 GCF 的名稱，他們是表達肯定的態度，這個就是以前的資料，提供給各位參考。各位對於我們提供 2014 年、2015 年的會議紀錄及 210 頁的附件資料，有沒有甚麼問題跟意見？好，如果沒有的話，這個只是我們准予備查。

我們現在進行動議部分，我們在想是不是在朝著 GCF 走的時候，剛剛亞洲的部分，香港是建議兩年前決定，我們在設定將來 GCF 是不是能夠考慮在三年前決定，這方面大家也漸漸地取得共識，因為這個部份，今天除了亞洲的部分之外，只有 UNALE 巴西來，至於歐盟本來已經報名了，到了最後一個禮拜臨時取消，如果它們有來今年亞洲以外就有兩大組織了。NCSL 最早的時候有來參加過，

所以今天可能難以做成決議。

但是我們大家是不是可以建議大家都要支持巴西，明年去巴西，到巴西的時候，我們接續討論再把他擴大成 GCF，因為明年巴西辦理會議時，我相信歐盟會去，美國也會去，那就是缺我們亞洲這一塊。如果我亞洲去支持的話，討論 GCF 會更具代表性，所以我們是不是先支持巴西，明年到巴西去，由他們來號召大家來討論 GCF 的事情，不知道巴西認為如何？我們就是鼓勵大家去，因為他們說單單美洲就有三十五個國家會參加。

Kennedy Nunes (巴西全國州議會及議員聯盟, UALE) :



巴西明年的年會確實會邀請美國州議會議員聯盟 NCSL、全美洲的 COPA、還有南美洲的各國州議會，這會是亞太國家和美洲國家很好的交流機會。

林晉章：

因為其他的國家都沒有，所以我們是不是做成一個決議，2020 年我們亞洲的國家盡量組團到巴西去，其他 2021、2022 我們就暫時不談了？好。

我們來進行第二個，這個就不必在這裡談了，因為 GCF 今天在這裡只有巴西跟亞洲，美國跟歐盟這次都沒來，澳洲的部分也沒來，所以 B 我們這次就不討論，然後我想 C 的部分也不討論，至於 D 的部分就留到明年在巴西的時候我們再討論。

我們今年就只針對我們亞洲的部分來處理，我們亞洲憲章的問題，因此 B、C、D 的部份我們今天就不討論了，也不做決定好不好？各位有沒有意見？這樣我們的程序就會進行得比較快。好，都支持。

我們工作人員會修改那個簽署板，就是只有剛剛通過的第六點，我們就只簽署這個，看看我們怎麼樣把它寫上去，讓大家等下在上面簽署。等一下閉幕典禮的時候，我們的會長會帶領大家在上面簽署，我們要全力支持成立 GCF。

我們現在接著進行第五項，有沒有其他的臨時動議？如果沒有，我們非常地謝謝各位，今天我們 B4 場次的會議就進行到這裡。非常感謝各位，我們現在休



息一下，等一下五點鐘的時候，我們就要做各組的總結報告，然後進行閉幕儀式。

Moderator:

Chin-chang LIN

Honorary President of Taiwan Councilors Forum (TCF)

Discussion Topic:

1. Reviewing on the 4th ACF, discussing on the host country of the 5th ACF and signing the ACF Joint Statement.
2. The Preparatory Meeting for Global Councils Forum (GCF)

Participants:

- Yoshiaki Matsuda (松田良昭), Chairman of Japanese Local Councilors Alliance (JLCA), JAPAN
 - Danilo Dayanghirang, National Chairman of Philippine Councilors League (PCL), PHILIPPINES
 - Nirunde Praditkul, The Second Vice-Chairman of Bangkok Metropolitan Council (BMC), THAILAND
 - Fozia Khalid Waraich, President of Local Councils Association of the Punjab (LCAP), PAKISTAN
 - Alan T. Marbou, Speaker of 11th Koror State Legislature, PALAU
 - Siliga Atiake Kofe, Chief of House of Clan of Funafuti, TUVALU
 - Kennedy Nunes, President of União Nacional dos Legisladores e Legislativos Estaduais (UNALE), BRAZIL
 - Kam Man-fung, Head Delegate / Hong Kong Community Governance Forum
-

TCF Honorary President Chin-chang LIN (林晉章榮譽理事長):

Okay, so we're still waiting for the head delegates from Brazil. And please, all the head delegates are already present and we are going to start session B4.

It consists of 2 halves. The first half will talk about the topic of this year's Asia Councils Forum. We are going to look at the joint declaration of ACF, and then, we are going to talk about the host country of the 5th ACF and review this year's ACF. And the second half, we'll talk about the preparation, preparatory meeting for Global Councils Forum. So please, if you have the menu, it starts from page 200.

First of all, let's take a look at the agenda. As I mentioned, we have 3 motions in the agenda, a joint statement by Asian Councils Forum and then the 2020 ACF host country and review on the 2019 ACF. Regarding your agenda, do you have any opinions, or do you have anything to share?

PCL Chairman Danilo Dayanghirang:

Under the constitution abidance of the Philippine Councilors League, in the commitment, we have to go back to the board first, but let it be assured, that the manifestation of unity will be given more weight. When we go back to Manila, we'll return back and inform you of the National Board of the Philippine Councilors League decision. But in general, we are, for one, accept our constitution. This allow us, the Councilors League, without consulting first the National Board. We will inform you the updates. Thank you very much.

TCF Honorary President Chin-chang LIN (林晉章榮譽理事長):

Agenda-wise, if we all approve, then we'll carry on with our meeting today.

First, we're going to talk about the joint statement of ACF. And beforehand, we did send the draft of the joint statement to all the delegations. And right now, on the desk, you see 2 documents. They are both drafts. They are both draft documents, and there's only one, there are 2 differences between the 2 drafts. First, it says purpose on the second page. We have a section on purpose and in this section, the Japanese delegation proposed, they actually made a suggestion that it doesn't necessarily have to be included in this statement, but they want to make sure that we all agree with this purpose. And if we, we've reviewed the purpose. We believe that this purpose is in line with our objectives, so maybe we should just read the purpose first.

Emcee:

In the era of globalization, local councilors worldwide share the social responsibility to cooperate and create economic vitality. The Asian Councils Forum aims to facilitate cross-border communication and mutual understanding, while respecting the values of freedom, equality and diversity in Asia. Through cross-border synergies, the Asian Councils Forum ensures regional stability and supports the development of future talents to eventually make a contribution to world peace and prosperity.

TCF Honorary President Chin-chang LIN:

Okay, so this purpose was proposed by the Japanese delegations. So maybe Matsuda president, you have further explanation? So, this is a proposal made by the Japanese delegation. We really want your approval. President Matsuda said that maybe we can

approve the purpose, but it doesn't necessarily have to be included in the joint statement. Is that what you're trying to say?

JLCA President Yoshiaki Matsuda:

Yes.

TCF Honorary President Chin-chang LIN (林晉章榮譽理事長):

So, we can approve this purpose, but this purpose may not have to be included in our joint statement. And as president of PCL, according to their constitution, they need to go back to check with their board before they can sign anything. Just like 2015, when the President Maybelyn came to Taiwan, we decided that the Philippines could host ACF. And she also mentioned that she has to check with her board, and she expressed willingness to host ACF, but she needed to go back to the board. And after they got the approval of the board, they invited me to go over to Philippines and they presented me with the letter of the decision of the board. So, I agree with Chairman Danilo Dayanghirang because after our discussion today, even though we approve this statement, we still have to bring this statement back to our respective parliament or councils for further approval.



2016 PCL President
Madam Maybelyn Fernandez (Left 1)

Back in 2014, we also passed a statement. At the time, we had representatives from the US, as well as Japan, and the EU representatives also talked about that they need to get the approval of their board officially. And once they got the approval, they send the official letter to us. Now, to go back

to your earlier comments from the chairman from PCL, we agree with your comments earlier.

In other words, today we will have a discussion to approve this statement. We will also have the signing ceremony. However, we will also have in the addendum, saying that this has to be officially approved by different boards of our member organizations.

HK Delegation Leader Man-fung KAM:

Thank you, chairman. I want to talk about Item 4 and Item 5. Here, it talks about democratic nations. Could you say nations or regions? When you say each country, could you also say each country and region? If not, we may have a problem with the wording.

TCF Honorary President Chin-chang LIN (林晉章榮譽理事長):

Okay, for Item 4 and 5, okay, I'll stop. Please take a note of that. This is a draft and purpose was not put into that draft. But the Japanese delegation talked about we should have the purpose approved. However, the purpose paragraph doesn't have to be put in the statement. Now, regarding this motion, perhaps we can make a decision right now. And of course, you need to have the official approval of your board and then, you should send us an official letter. Now, regarding the purpose paragraph that was read, are there any feedback? Is there any feedback on the purpose or any suggestions to revise? Any opposition?

PCL Chairman Danilo Dayanghirang:

We will reserve our right to, what to call this, to sign this for the meantime, after we get the word approval in our respective countries. As far as Philippines is concerned because we are prohibited by the constitution to go into contract without passing first through the board. But let it be known to everybody that we will support all the statement as manifested by the conveyor.

TCF Honorary President Chin-chang LIN (林晉章榮譽理事長):

Okay. I understand your stance and we should respect your stance. Yes, indeed, this is the international practice. And we didn't have enough time to prepare this declaration, the statement. We did not give you enough time to get the approval from your board. So today, we'll just have the discussions. If we form a consensus, we will form a decision, that is, the version will be sent back to each board for approval. But perhaps, your suggestion is that today, we are not signing the statement. Is that your suggestion?

PCL Chairman Danilo Dayanghirang:

Philippine's concern, we reserve our right to sign that in the proper time because as what I said.

TCF Honorary President Chin-chang LIN (林晉章榮譽理事長):

Okay, so what I mean is, today we did make preparations for a signing ceremony. But with an addendum saying that this needs to be officially approved by the board of each organization. That's one option. Or perhaps, option 2 is we can sign that next year.

PCL Chairman Danilo Dayanghirang:

We'll discuss this in the board.

TCF Honorary President Chin-chang LIN (林晉章榮譽理事長):

Say, we signed the declaration or statement first, and then with an addendum, that this is only officially approved to when you got the approval from the board. Is that viable?

PCL Chairman Danilo Dayanghirang:

I cannot do that because the authority to sign would be...

TCF Honorary President Chin-chang LIN (林晉章榮譽理事長):

Okay. Yes, this is something that needs to be respected. Today, we will have the discussion and then you can bring that statement back to your organization. Otherwise, I know I'm putting you on a difficult spot. Regarding the Philippines suggestion, we can have discussion today and then, we're not signing the statement today. Any suggestions or any opinion on that? Opposition? Any opposition? If not, the decision is we are going to have a discussion to form a consensus. But today, we are not signing the statement. You can bring the statement back to your individual organization. So basically, the statement will be approved today, but we're not signing the statement today. Any opposition to this? If not, this option is approved.

PCL Chairman Danilo Dayanghirang:

The consensus building as to the statement, maybe in the right time, but as to affixing the signatures as part of the Philippine's concern, I have to give respect to the national board. We can agree the manifestation.

TCF Honorary President Chin-chang LIN (林晉章榮譽理事長):

Yes, we understand your position and everybody supports your position. Today, we're just gonna have a discussion, reach a consensus, but we are not signing the

statement. Thank you very much. The representative from the Philippines delegation. Now, we've distributed relevant material. I would like to ask the staff to quickly read it, this statement, without the purpose paragraph.

Emcee:

“We gather here in Taipei from different nations in Asia, recalling the commitment to broaden and deepen Asian interregional cooperation to further strengthen the Asian Councils Forum as envisaged in the joint statements of Asian Councils Forum in Japan on 21, August 2018.

Recalling the commitment to broaden and deepen Asian interregional cooperation to further strengthen the Asian Councils Forum as envisaged in the Joint Statement of Asian Councils Forum in Japan on 21 August 2018;

Noting that Asian Councils Forum aims to bring together local councilors and government officials from each Asian nation and gather the insights from their experience on local governance for effective cross-border communication;

Recognizing that synergies among the national or regional council assemblies from each country in Asia will contribute towards regional connectivity, peace and stability, parliamentary democracy, economic prosperity and sustainable development;

Acknowledging that the necessity of the mutual interactions and cooperation facilitated by Asian Councils Forum helps foster mutual understanding and establish trustful relationships among all the culturally diverse Asian regions and nations;

Reaffirming the commitment of the joint statement signed in Asian Councils Forum in Japan on 21 August 2018 for enhancing regional connectivity with the principles of openness, transparency, inclusiveness;

Appreciating the contribution made by all the participants from each Asian nation in Asian Councils Forums from 2016 to 2019. With joint efforts, we together promote peaceful cooperation, cross-border experience exchange, and most importantly, democratic values.

We hereby approve and sign the contents of the "Joint Statement of 4th Asian Councils Forum," stressing the fundamental values of national or regional council assemblies in democratic states as an indispensable pillar for a more efficient, more participatory and better-quality democracy, and we assert as follows:



First, any national or regional council assemblies that agree with the mission of the Asian Councils Forum shall be eligible to participate in;

Second, every participant of Asian Councils Forum shall be treated equally regardless of racial, complexion, gender, language, or religious differences;

Third, our participants shall be encouraged to share with one another under the spirit of non-governmental organization (NGO) and nonprofit organization (NPO), to ensure world peace and to benefit all of humanity;

Fourth, all participants of Asian Councils Forum shall originate from democratic nations;

Fifth, participation in the Asian Councils Forum shall abide by the law of each country;

Sixth, all participants of Asian Councils Forum agree to assist and support the foundation of Global Councils Forum.

TCF Honorary President Chin-chang LIN (林晉章榮譽理事長):

Thank you. I believe you have all read the statements and we also heard the suggestion of our Hong Kong representative regarding Article 4 and Article 5 of the statement. Okay, we will work on that. Okay. Hong Kong representative provided us with feedback on Article 4 and Article 5.

And we will revise accordingly, any questions regarding the recalling paragraph? If not, it's treated as consensus.

Any questions regarding the noting paragraph? Okay, it's consensus.

What about the recognizing paragraph? Any feedback? Okay, consensus reached.

Acknowledging paragraph? Okay, consensus reached.

Reaffirming paragraph? Okay, consensus reached.

Appreciating paragraph? Okay, consensus reached. Yes?

PCL Member:

I would like to go back to "recognizing" paragraph. It reads "recognizing the synergies among national or regional council assemblies from each country in Asia will

contribute towards regional connectivity, peace and stability, parliamentary democracy, economic prosperity and sustainable development.”

We suggest that instead of putting the “national” or “regional”, we put recognizing the synergies among “local” assemblies in “Asia”. So we remove from each country so that we will have no, that was what the honorable HK Delegation Leader was saying earlier. Maybe, instead of putting national or regional council, we’ll just change it to local councils. And local council assemblies in Asia.

TCF Honorary President Chin-chang LIN (林晉章榮譽理事長):

Thank you very much for your feedback and suggestion. This is something that we’ve been considering as well. Earlier, we were thinking about, well, as Mayor Ko mentioned this morning, we have IPU. We have UCLG, alliance of global local governments. What we’re lacking is a global alliance for local representatives. For UCLG, it’s an alliance of local governments and there are 2 categories of members. First, their members might be national representatives, and then there also have local government representatives as members. In reality, when we talk about GCF later, we are going to talk about our charters and we will have a prepared taskforce. However, we have not done any discussion in this area. So I think this suggestion made by our representative from the Philippines is the future direction that we want to focus on.

Should we be like UCLG? For example, PCL, it’s the national league, and for Taiwan, we have the Taiwan Councilors Forum. Japan, they have a body like this, and in Pakistan, they also have an organization. It’s just in Thailand, they do not have a national level councils alliance yet. And so, before they established national organization of all the councils, would they be able to participate individually? So these are some of the things we need to discuss and I think our friend from Philippines already propose a great suggestion because this is something we need to discuss, perhaps today. We will establish a taskforce and involving Japan, Philippines, and Taiwan, and then the founding parties. And then, we can talk about the charter of GCF and to clarify the issues, that is, we accept the issue raised in the section of “recognizing” proposed by the Philippines, and hopefully, and then, we’ll deal with this through a taskforce. Do we all agree? Do we all agree? So, in terms of procedures, today we will recognize that there’s some problems, some issues in this paragraph because right now, Thailand did not have a national organization. So perhaps in the

future, if we establish the GCF, Bangkok can apply to be a member on its own. And for Palau, they have 16 different islands. They do not have a national organization. Can we be a member of the Global Councils Forum as an individual municipal council? And for UCLG, they allow that. And for us, GCF, we do not have to reach a decision today.

We can establish the taskforce to discuss this problem. This also respond to what Hong Kong said, that they are not a country, they're just a region. So, maybe we should form a taskforce and we don't have to rush because it's not something we have to reach a decision right now. This is something that's going to go on forever anyways.

So if there's no objection, I think especially the paragraph on the "recognizing", we need to really talk about the qualification of our members. For example, in Hong Kong, they are probably in the process of forming a higher-level organization of various councils.

I know that right now in Taiwan, in Japan, in Philippines, we have a national level organization, but we still have some of the local councils that they don't have a national level organization in their own country. So if we all agree, then obviously, we'll accept the suggestions made by our friend from the Philippines and then we'll form a taskforce to discuss this, discuss our charter in the future. And as for the wordings including regions, place, or countries, we will do that in the taskforce as well.

Okay, so the first page, if there's no further objections, we'll move on to the second page.

BMC Member:

Good afternoon. Yeah. Mr. Chair, allow me to express my explanation about the municipal league association of Thailand. This is a national level of the local government in Thailand. It includes council too, as well as municipal body. So I would like to tell you that in Thailand, we have the association such like in national level too. In case of Bangkok Metropolitan, if you accept our organization to include in Asian Councils Forum, I think that we can attend by our own because we just a kind of local government in Thailand. My suggestion has nothing to do against the suggestion of Philippine or Hong Kong.

TCF Honorary President Chin-chang LIN (林晉章榮譽理事長):

Okay, thank you. So in the future, if we have a taskforce, we can also involve our friends from Thailand to also send a representative to be on the taskforce so we can further discuss the details of our charter.

They mentioned that they have an association that includes mayors, governments and councilors, but in fact that in many countries, they do have this kind of organization. This time, around Sri Lankan organization is the same as the Thai organization. That organization includes councilors, mayors and municipal governments. Why? Because UCLG, the chairman, the president is a South African councilor.

Why can a councilor be the UCLG chairman? Because according to the South African system, the role of the mayor is assumed by a councilor. So the mayor must also be a councilor, and that is why as a mayor, as a city councilor, he participates in UCLG and he was elected the chairperson. But he himself was originally a councilor, and because of that status, he could assume the role of the mayor.

And obviously, there are different systems in the world. So, from what we heard this morning from Mayor Ko, he also participated in UCLG because Taipei City is a member. But he is in full support that the councilors in Asia can organize a forum. He's also happy to see that around the world, we have this one organization involving only city councilors. So, once again, thank you, the Thai representative.

So if we don't have any objections with the main paragraph...

UNALE President Kennedy Nunes:

Okay, so I have a suggestion. In Brazil, we have the UNALE. We promote the CEDAW diplomacy. This is a diplomatic activity launched by local councils. Traditional diplomacy deals with national defense, the issues of borders and territories. And today, municipal councils, we promote a "paradiplomacy". We exchange experience.

Because our roles, we are not to replace the central government or parliament. We understand their responsibilities and their roles, and we understand our role, especially as municipal councils. We are closer to our citizens. We are closer to our citizens compared to the central government and government agencies.

And therefore, my suggestion is just like the South American Councils Alliance or the

UNALE with the American Councils Alliance, I think we used the word “paradiplomacy” to describe our activity. So whether it’s the entire America, the continent of America or South America or Brazil, after we started using the word “paradiplomacy,” we never encountered issues when it comes to wording or the words we choose. So that’s just my personal opinion.

TCF Honorary President Chin-chang LIN (林晉章榮譽理事長):

Okay. So, thank you, chairman Nunes. They have a UNALE. It’s an alliance of 27 municipal councils, and next year in February, he’s going to become the president of COPA. So I think they have many years of experience, so I think we can really learn from their experience and as references for our future operation.

So we will read over the rest of the articles and we will listen to your opinions. When it comes to the words nation or when it comes to national, do we replace them with the word “paradiplomacy,” I think it all means that we are closer to people and we are here for exchange, not to take over the job of central government.

Okay, so paragraph one, any objections? Okay, so we all approve?

PCL Member:

First paragraph, the word “recalling,” it has another meaning, which sometimes would mean “remove.” “Recalling” means “removing.” May I suggest that we change it to the word “building on.” That way, it will be more active. The first paragraph, not “reaffirming.” The first paragraph. The “recalling.”

Yes, ‘cause “recall” could also mean legally as “remove,” yes, to “take back”. So I suggest that we change it with the word “building on” the commitment to broaden and deepen and so on. So, rather than “recalling,” we use “building on.” We build on the commitments already made previously.

TCF Honorary President Chin-chang LIN (林晉章榮譽理事長):

Thank you very much, the comment from our Philippine representative. She’s also an attorney and we will take your suggestion. Thank you very much for reminding us.

Okay, number 1, the earlier feedback and comments were all very good. Okay. Consensus reached.

Number 2, okay. Consensus reached.

Number 3, our members are going to be NGOs and NPOs. This is very important. We are an organization of NGOs and NPOs. Any comments? Okay. Consensus reached for article 3.

Article 4 and article 5, in addition the comments by our Hong Kong representative, are there other comments? If not, okay, consensus reached.

Number 6, regarding number 6, I think we can reach consensus today. Back in 2014, we had the idea, the organization in the Philippines and in Japan were formed very early on, but there hasn't been enough collaboration between different organizations. And in 2014, we invited NCSL and other organizations, and we actually got the invitation from UNALE early on. In 2014, we also invited a representative from CALRE from the European Union and that was the first time when we had a Japanese delegation. And we actually wanted to talk about forming GCF in 2015. However, during discussions in 2015, the president of CALRE, the Italian representative, told us since our introduction and our platform in 2014, they actually formed an alliance with ACF. And in October of that year, the European organization invited organizations from Japan, Philippines, to Milan, where we met UNALE from Brazil and FCM from Canada. So, our organizations met in Milan and we had a great time discussing important issues. And like I said, in the European meeting, we had representatives from Taiwan, Japan, and the Philippines, and he suggested that we should form ACF and that is why the Philippines hosted the first one ACF, and then Taiwan hosted the second one in 2017, Japan hosted the third ACF last year.

We are now in the 4th ACF. We have more and more participants every year. Now, we need to come up with our detailed charter for ACF. I would like to form a Global Councils Forum together with our European and US counterparts, as well as counterpart in Australia. We should form a Global Councils Forum.

In other words, in November next year in Brazil, I understand Brazil is far away from us, but today, our Brazilian representative invited us to all come to their conference. And I think in the very near future, we will be able to form, indeed, a Global Councils Forum. Here, I would like to say yes to the invitation from Brazil and understand that many of our Asian friends are also interested in going to Brazil next year.

Same thing for number 4 and number 5. So today, shouldn't we express our support for the foundation of Global Councils Forum? Yes, the Philippines.

PCL Chairman Danilo Dayanghirang:

We are supporting the Global Council Forum. This is a good initiative international relationship among ourselves. So we don't have problem of organizing it. But before that, I just want to go back, if you don't mind, to the suggestion of the Philippines that instead of "recalling," it should be "rebuilding." I just want to, once and for all, resolve this because when you said that you will study it, but I suggest we decide now that instead of "recalling," we put now "rebuilding," "building on."

Not recalling, but "building on." It should be positive thoughts for cooperation. Yes. The other one is the global, we don't have a problem.

TCF Honorary President Chin-chang LIN (林晉章榮譽理事長):

Okay, we will modify the text accordingly. Thank you for your suggestion. Regarding number 6, which concerns forum agree to assist and support the foundation of Global Council Forum, that this is agreed by everybody. I think a strong consensus is reached on this item and this will very helpful when we try to give the voice from Asia to our global counterparts. It is my wish that we reach consensus on this item. Any feedback? Any comments? Any comments or opposition?

BMC Member:

Allow me to make a suggestion. Number 4, you change the "nation" to "regions" according to the recommendation of Hong Kong, 'cause if you change the word "nation" to "regions," it means nonsense. It refers to nothing because democratic "regions," can you clarify where is "democratic regions"?

TCF Honorary President Chin-chang LIN (林晉章榮譽理事長):

Thank you for your comment. I will like to thank the comment from Thailand. While regarding this part, actually said earlier, we are talking about global local governments, they have their national organization, but they can also have local government. For example, a local government can be a member.

So for ACF and GCF, perhaps we can use the UCLG example. Local association or local government can become a member, and since we are an organization of councilors, so only councilor association can become a member. However, this is not an urgent issue. Like I said, we are going to form a taskforce on the charter and I would urge all interested parties to send representatives to this taskforce to work on the detail

wording, the text of this charter.

HK Delegation Leader Man-fung KAM:

Allow me to clarify. I did not suggest to take out the word “nations.” I’m simply suggesting that we can add 2 words or “regions” because Hong Kong is SAR, “special administrative region”. So we are only representing a “region.” We are not representing a “nation”. That is our political reality.

TCF Honorary President Chin-chang LIN (林晉章榮譽理事長):

Thank you. I also understand the reality. I think we are not going to make a decision on that. We rather are going to form a taskforce to work on the text of the charter for both ACF and GCF.

Back to Article 6, supporting the establishment of Global Councils Forum, this is to give our voice to our American and European counterparts. I think that will be instrumental in the forming of GCF. I’m sure you all support Article 6. If that’s the case, please applaud to show your support.

Now, a question to our representative from the Philippines. Today, we are only affirming Article 6. Is that okay with you?

PCL Chairman Danilo Dayanghirang:

Yes.

TCF Honorary President Chin-chang LIN (林晉章榮譽理事長):

Later on, when we have a signing ceremony, we’re all agreeing to this sentence only. All participants of Asian Councils Forum agree to assist and support the foundation of Global Council Forum. Okay. The signing ceremony will only cover this part. Okay, that’s the end of discussion for this one.

And today, we also pass the purpose statement proposed by our Japanese friends. We are not passing the statement, rather we are going to form a taskforce. We encourage our member organizations to send representatives to our taskforce. The taskforce will discuss the detailed charter of our organization. And we would like to invite UNALE as our advisor to give us suggestions and advice. Okay, that’s that.

Let’s move on to the next item. The host country for the 5th ACF, the first was hosted

in the Philippines, second in Taiwan, third in Japan, fourth in Taiwan. Taiwan hosted the second and the fourth because at the very beginning, we did not have a lot of members. Taiwan volunteered as a founding organization to host ACF every 2 years. Now, since we have more members, Taiwan is, again, volunteering to host ACF every 4 years. That is our proposal.

This year, we are hosting ACF. Next year, 2020, which should be the host country? Hong Kong expressed its intent to host the forum. Due to the recent political reality, perhaps, it's not very viable to have ACF in Hong Kong, but the willingness is definitely there in the future. I also asked the President of the Philippine Delegation and chairman of PCL has expressed that their members and councilors would like to go to different Asian countries' few platforms of ACF. So they are not very keen on hosting ACF again so soon.

Or perhaps, we have a very large delegation from Thailand this year and I understand that last year, you hosted your ASEAN City Councilors Conference.

PCL Chairman Danilo Dayanghirang:

Can I say something? We, Filipinos, believe on equal opportunities. We had that already in Manila once, but our friend from Thailand would take it for the next venue about ACF. We would also appreciate that. We believe on equal opportunities. For us, we don't have problem. If Thailand will not take it, the Philippines will come in. But for the meantime, I believe that equal opportunity should be given to everybody and we would appreciate to give it to Thailand.

TCF Honorary President Chin-chang LIN (林晉章榮譽理事長):

Okay, so thank you Philippines. I think our Thai representative is going to speak.

BMC Second-Vice Chairman Nirunde Praditkul:

We will have to go back and discuss a little bit. First of all, we need to take it back to Bangkok Council for discussion first. If it's approved, we'll pass on this issue with the Ministry of Interior, and if approval is granted, we can organize, we can be the host because the delegation this time around, it's only one third of the city council.

TCF Honorary President Chin-chang LIN (林晉章榮譽理事長):

Okay, so thank you for your clarification. We respect your procedure. So, the first

year was hosted by the Philippines. President Maybelyn, she also said the same thing, that they have to take it back to their board and then, we need the Ministry of Interior's approval. So I fully understand. And obviously, we received official approval.

Madam Maybelyn, can you stand up and...yes, she was one of the founding presidents with me and Matsuda. So, we discussed among us and we were very glad that the Philippines were willing to take over as host of the first ACF. I think I also agree with the equal opportunity and obviously, Thailand has a big delegation this time around, and if they're willing to be the host, obviously, we'll wait for them to take it back to discuss with their fellow councilors and the Ministry of Interior. Just like a few years ago, we will wait for their official response and reply. And if Thailand cannot host, due to various factors and considerations to host next year, then Philippines will take over.

It's just like last year when Japan was hosting. When Japan was hosting, they asked us who's going to host this year's forum and I told them that my term was expiring and we needed to wait for a new president to be elected. So, they all agreed and we all waited until this July that we have new president and that we host this forum now in December.

And so, we'll include this in our meeting minutes. Thailand will take back the issue and they will give us a response as soon as possible after they have discussed this with their fellow councilors, as well as their Ministry of Interior. And if they can, they will be hosting next year's forum. If not, we'll pass on this message to the Philippines and the Philippines can start their discussion. Hopefully, we can sustain the Asian Councils Forum. It has been 4 years in the room and hopefully next year, we'll have someone to host the forum. So I will thank you in advance. Thank you Philippines. Thank you Thailand.

HK Delegation Leader Man-fung KAM:

I have a proposal. So, why don't we just say that 2020 will be Thailand and 2021 will be Philippines? And if Thailand cannot host next year's forum, then the Philippines can just move forward to 2020. So, let's just set the hosts for the next 2 years so they can start the process, and they also enjoy more time for preparation.

TCF Honorary President Chin-chang LIN (林晉章榮譽理事長):

But right now, I think it's hard enough for us to find the host for next year, so maybe, hopefully, Hong Kong can host 2021. Hong Kong, even though it's not one of the founding parties. ACF was founded by Japan, Taiwan and Philippines, but Hong Kong was here with us since the beginning. They participated in the 1st Asian Councils Forum, second, third and fourth, and obviously, it should be their turn to host. But we all understand your situation there. So we will be patient and hopefully, we'll just determine the host for next year. And if everything, maybe in the future, we have more countries, more regions, then perhaps Hong Kong can host the forum. So let's just decide the host for next year, 2020. Okay, so we've made our decision.

We'll move on to the next item on the agenda. We have to apologize that due to limited manpower, we cannot provide you with the most ideal hospitality and if you have any suggestions regarding the organization of this event, perhaps you can share with us your opinions now. And if you don't feel like speaking out loud, you can write it down and submit to us because all these opinions can be reserved for the next host as references.

UNALE President Kennedy Nunes:

Remember, next year.

TCF Honorary President Chin-chang LIN (林晉章榮譽理事長):

Okay. Yes, he's once again reminding us. So if we're hosting the Asian Councils Forum, it should not be in November because Brazil is inviting all of us to go to Brazil.

Thank you. So regarding this year's forum, do you have any suggestions and opinions and thoughts? You're being too kind. So I hope the head representative can collect opinions from the members of your delegation. Please bear with us and after we are done today, we provided transportation to take you to the restaurant and hopefully, we can mingle and to further strengthen our friendship.

Tomorrow, in the morning, it's going to be quite early because tomorrow, including Japan, Hong Kong, Thailand, they are all flying out tomorrow. And for President Matsuda, they will have to go to the airport after lunch. And Thailand, they are leaving in the evening, so they are wondering whether they can skip the afternoon session. So right now, we are still discussing this with New Taipei City. And Hong Kong is leaving tomorrow. I know some of you are leaving on Monday, and so if you are leaving on Monday, you can also participate in our tour tomorrow.

And because we are going to New Taipei City, so we have to leave the hotels at 8 o'clock, and so we'll have to meet at the lobby at 7:50. So please finish your breakfast and meet us at 7:50. And even though it's a long way to New Taipei City, to our destinations, but I think it's definitely worthwhile. And so, if you have any opinions, please, you can write it down. You can submit a written proposal to us. And also, remember next year in November, they are going to invite us to their event in Brazil.

Okay, move on to the next item on the agenda. So I think for issues regarding ACF, I think we are done with the items regarding ACF. Now, take a look at page 205, 205. Okay, sorry, page 203. 203, this is the joint statement signed last year in Japan. So it's attached here as a reference. So the statement is on page 203 and 204. And now, we are on page 205. Obviously, this is not a very important discussion, but we'll still have to take a look at it.

On page 207, we have the, maybe we can't really discuss too many details, but let's explain some of our opinions, some of our thoughts 'cause we have to go through the procedure. Do we all agree with that? If not, we'll just follow the agenda and see what we... And so, 2014 and 15, we included the meeting minutes here. We're going to read the meeting minutes just because some countries were not present back then. So we'll just read over the meeting minutes and to just refresh your memory.

Emcee:

The Statements of 2014 meeting minutes are as follows:

(A) Annual GCF meeting could be hosted simultaneously with the annual meeting of the hosting organization. The chairman of the hosting organization shall be the GCF chairman of the year.

(B) Foreign topic. The hosting organization shall appoint in annual topic for each GCF conference.

(C) Registration Fees. Each participant is subject to a registration fee for attendance, approximately USD500, for meeting materials, excluding flight tickets and accommodations. Note: ACF charges the registration fee of US200 dollars in 2016 with general consent.

(D) Simultaneous translation services. The hosting organization shall provide simultaneous translation services from the local language to English. The fees of the additional language translation services are at the expenses of the participating organizations who require their services.

TCF Honorary President Chin-chang LIN (林晉章榮譽理事長):

Okay, and then, let's go back to page 205. We have the 2015 meeting minutes.

Emcee:

2015 meeting minutes are as follows:

(A) Official foreign name. Global Councils' Forum is the official name that is recognized and acknowledged by the participants.

(B) Establishments initiative. Establishments initiative is recognized and acknowledged by the participants.

(C) Asian Councils Forum. Taiwan, Japan and the Philippines shall first establish an Asian Councils Forum, then carry NCSL, UNALE could join the Asian Councils Forum to quickly expand the forum into the Global Councils Forum. Note: ACF has thus been held annually in 3 Asian countries, the Philippines in 2016, Taiwan in 2017, and Japan in 2018.

TCF Honorary President Chin-chang LIN (林晉章榮譽理事長):

This is provided for your reference. The minutes from 2014 and 2015. Now, please refer to the attachment. Please go to page 210. This is NCSL, Japan, CALRE, as well as Taiwan. And this statement was agreed to by Japan and the US. But CALRE has to take this back to its board for approval. Now, page 211 is the reply from their official president. At the time, US and Japan agreed to the statement. Like I said, CALRE said they need to take it back to their organization for official approval. And this is the approval letter they sent to us afterwards.

They also support the name GCF. Again, this is provided for your reference. Regarding the 2014, 2015 minutes, do we have any feedback or comments from the floor? Okay, this has been recognized and noted. Next, motions in the agenda. As we are trying to form the GCF, earlier, we had discussions on ACF and Hong Kong proposed that we should set it up 2 years earlier, or determine the host country 2 years earlier. For GCF, perhaps we can determine the host country 3 years earlier. Most of our members are from Asia and we only have the Brazilian delegates with us. And the European representative wanted to be with us, but couldn't make it. NCSL participated in the first ACF. Today, most of us here are from Asia. Perhaps, we cannot have a lot of say in GCF, but I would suggest that we should support Brazil. Everybody should go to Brazil next year and we can pick up the discussion in Brazil next year to further talk

about how we can establish the GCF because we will have the European and American counterparts at the Brazilian event.

If we, Asian countries, all send representatives to the Brazilian event, that would be very beneficial. That is my suggestion. Any comment from our Brazilian friend? In other words, we encourage all of you to go to Brazil. There will be 35 countries from the Americas represented at the Brazilian event.

UNALE President Kennedy Nunes:

Yes, indeed. In our congress next year, we are going to invite members from NCSL to participate, as well as members of COPA and members from Southern American countries. We would welcome representatives from Asia-Pacific to attend to our event as well.

TCF Honorary President Chin-chang LIN (林晉章榮譽理事長):

For 2021 and 2022, we don't have an answer yet. But for 2020, we would like to encourage our Asian friends to all go to the Brazilian event. Can we decide on that? If there's not opposition, it is so decided. In 2020, the host country should be Brazil. We will leave 2021, 2022 for later discussion.

Today, we only have representatives from Asia and Brazil. We don't have our American, the US and European or Australian representatives, so we cannot discuss Item B. We can skip C as well. As for D, again, I think we can take up that discussion in Brazil next year. This year, we will only focus on the charter of ACF. As for B, C and D, we are not going to discuss or make decisions on those items. Is that okay, everyone? Okay, everybody is in full support of this? Great. I would like to ask the staff to prepare the signing board. We are only signing for Article 6 or Statement 6. Please make the relevant preparation for that. At the closing ceremony, the president of TCF will take the lead and we will also invite presidents and chairmen of our member organizations to have the signing ceremony.

Now, any other motion? We would like to thank you for your participation. This concludes session B4. Thank you very much.

TCF 台灣地方議員聯盟

Taiwan Councilors Forum

